#### **IDAHO STATE TAX COMMISSION**

11321 Chinden Blvd., Building 2 Coral Conference Room (208) 334-7500

# APPEALS RESOLUTION MEETING MINUTES

November 23, 2020

This meeting was set to render a final resolution for the appeals dockets indicated. These dockets were heard and discussed in accordance with Idaho Open Meeting Law.

Each individual appellant had an opportunity to provide information related to their case, including an informal hearing if requested.

The Appeals Resolution Meeting convened at 2:00 p.m. Guests were allowed to attend via telephone. Staff in attendance in the conference room were Commissioner Janet Moyle, Michael Chakarun, Alan Pack, Cynthia Adrian, Lisa Palmer, Jim Gunter, David Bettencourt, and Meredith Hodgson. Joining the meeting through Microsoft Teams were Commissioner Jeff McCray, Commissioner Elliot Werk, Commissioner Tom Katsilometes, Mark Stones, Kolby Reddish, Amber Kauffman, Becky Ihli, Janice Boyd, Kim Wind, Andrea Madsen, and Elisa Magnuson.

To protect the confidentiality of taxpayer's tax and personal information, the Commission will not discuss this type of information in the public portion of this meeting. Likewise, the Tax Commission will not allow public comment at this meeting.

#### **Business Requiring Vote of the Commission**

Each Commissioner has had the opportunity to review the file for each docket on the agenda and ask questions of appeals staff prior to this meeting. Additionally, each Commissioner has a summary of each docket in their meeting folder. The Oversight Commissioner for each tax type will not vote to decide the outcome of those dockets.

**Action Item:** Approve October 28, 2020 Minutes Janet Moyle Commissioner Werk moved to approve the minutes of the Appeals Resolution Meeting held on October 28, 2020. All Commissioners voted in the affirmative and the minutes of the Appeals Resolution Meeting held October 28, 2020 were approved.

Attorney Kolby Reddish reminded Commissioners of their responsibility to protect confidential taxpayer information and when it is appropriate to go into executive session.

a. Action Item: 1-774-405-632 Janet Moyle

Alan Pack is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Werk moved to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to

uphold the Notice and update interest as appropriate for Docket Number 1-774-405-632. Commissioner McCray seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## **b. Action Item:** 0-725-170-176 Janet Moyle

Alan Pack is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner McCray moved to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the modified Notice and update interest accordingly for Docket Number 0-725-170-176. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## c. Action Item: 0-648-660-992 Janet Moyle

Alan Pack is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Katsilometes moved to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to modify the Notice and update penalty and interest for Docket Number 0-648-660-992. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## d. Action Item: 1-540-737-024 Janet Moyle

Alan Pack is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Werk moved to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the Notice and update interest for Docket Number 1-540-737-024. Commissioner Katsilometes seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## e. Action Item: 1-969-821-696 Janet Moyle

Alan Pack is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner McCray made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the modified Notice and update interest for Docket Number 1-969-821-696. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

#### **f. Action Item:** 0-493-111-296 Janet Moyle

Alan Pack is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Werk made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to modify the Notice for Docket Number 0-493-111-296. Commissioner Katsilometes seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## g. Action Item: 0-179-423-232 Janet Moyle

Alan Pack is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Katsilometes made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the Notice for Docket Number 0-179-423-232. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## h. Action Item: 0-798-554-112 Janet Moyle

Alan Pack is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Katsilometes made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to enter into a closing agreement that specifies the correct amount of tax penalty and interest owed and Petitioner agrees to withdraw their protest for Docket Number 0-798-554-112. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## i. Action Item: 1-976-682-496 Janet Moyle

David Bettencourt is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Werk made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the Notice and update interest for Docket Number 1-976-682-496. Commissioner Katsilometes seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## j. Action Item: 0-069-642-240 Janet Moyle

David Bettencourt is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Werk made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the modified Notice and update interest for Docket Number 0-069-642-240. Commissioner McCray seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## k. Action Item: 1-256-433-664 Janet Moyle

Jim Gunter is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Werk made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the Notice and update interest for Docket Number 1-256-433-664. Commissioner Katsilometes seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

**I. Action Item:** 0-277-325-824 Janet Moyle

Jim Gunter is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner McCray made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the Notice and update interest for Docket Number 0-277-325-824. Commissioner Katsilometes seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## m. Action Item: 1-051-863-040 Janet Moyle

Lisa Palmer is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner McCray moved to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the Notice and update interest for Docket Number 1-051-863-040. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## n. Action Item: 1-585-686-528 Janet Moyle

Lisa Palmer is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Werk made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to modify the Notice and update penalty and interest for Docket Number 1-585-686-528. Commissioner Katsilometes seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

#### o. Action Item: 0-194-881-536 Janet Moyle

Lisa Palmer is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Commissioner Werk moved to go into Executive Session citing Idaho Code section 74-206(1)(d) to consider records that are exempt from disclosure pursuant to Idaho Code section 74-104(1). A roll call vote was taken by Meredith Hodgson, all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

The Commission met in Executive Session pursuant to Idaho Code section 74-206(1)(d). No matters requiring a vote of the Commission resulted from the Executive Session.

Commissioner Werk made a motion to table Docket Number 0-194-881-536 to allow for further consideration. Commissioner McCray seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; Commissioners Werk and McCray voted in the affirmative; Commissioner Katsilometes dissented and the motion was approved.

## p. Action Item: 0-867-168-256 Janet Moyle

Lisa Palmer is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Commissioner McCray moved to go into Executive Session citing Idaho Code section 74-206(1)(d) to consider records that are exempt from disclosure pursuant to Idaho Code section 74-104(1). A roll call vote was taken by Meredith Hodgson, all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

The Commission met in Executive Session pursuant to Idaho Code section 74-206(1)(d). No matters requiring a vote of the Commission resulted from the Executive Session.

Commissioner McCray made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner to cancel the Notice for Docket Number 0-867-168-256. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; Commissioners Werk and McCray voted in the affirmative; Commissioner Katsilometes dissented and the motion was approved.

## **q. Action Item:** 2-074-396-672

Lisa Palmer is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner McCray made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner to cancel the Notice for Docket Number 2-074-396-672. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; Commissioners Werk and McCray voted in the affirmative; Commissioner Katsilometes dissented and the motion was approved.

## r. Action Item: 1-065-658-368 Janet Moyle

Lisa Palmer is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Katsilometes made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to cancel the Notice for Docket Number 1-065-658-368. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## s. Action Item: 0-515-123-200 Janet Moyle

Lisa Palmer is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Katsilometes made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the Notice and update interest for Docket Number 0-515-123-200. Commissioner Werk seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

#### t. Action Item: 1-340-778-496 Janet Moyle

Lisa Palmer is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Moyle asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Moyle asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Werk made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to cancel the Notice for Docket Number 1-340-778-496. Commissioner Katsilometes seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Moyle; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

Commissioner Moyle turned the meeting over to Commissioner Katsilometes for property tax reduction benefit cases.

Janet Movle

**u. Action Item:** 1-821-091-840 Tom Katsilometes

David Bettencourt is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Katsilometes asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Katsilometes asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Werk made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to provide a property tax reduction benefit of \$490 for Docket Number 1-821-091-840. Commissioner Moyle seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Katsilometes; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

v. Action Item: 1-684-563-968 Tom Katsilometes

Lisa Palmer is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Katsilometes asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Katsilometes asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Moyle made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to make final the Intent to Deny letter for Docket Number 1-684-563-968. Commissioner McCray seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Katsilometes; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

Commissioner Katsilometes turned the meeting over to Commissioner Werk for sales and use tax cases.

w. Action Item: 0-783-034-368 Elliot Werk

Cynthia Adrian is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Werk asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Werk asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Katsilometes made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to cancel the Notice for Docket Number 0-783-034-368. Commissioner Moyle seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Werk; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

**x. Action Item:** 0-418-564-096 Elliot Werk

Cynthia Adrian is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Werk asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Werk asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner McCray made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to reject the settlement offer and uphold the Notice and update interest for Docket Number 0-418-564-096. Commissioner Katsilometes seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Werk; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

y. Action Item: 1-097-877-504 Elliot Werk

Cynthia Adrian is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Werk asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Werk asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner Moyle made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to uphold the Notice and update interest for Docket Number 1-097-877-504. Commissioner McCray seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Werk; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

## z. Action Item: 1-486-548-992 Elliot Werk

Cynthia Adrian is the Tax Appeals Specialist that handled this case. Commissioner Werk asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, Commissioner Werk asked for a motion for the resolution of this case. Commissioner McCray made a motion to approve the recommendation of the oversight commissioner and staff to reject the settlement offer and continue with the redetermination process. Commissioner Moyle seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken by Commissioner Werk; all voted in favor and the motion was approved.

Commissioner Werk adjourned the meeting at 3:25 p.m.