

**BEFORE THE TAX COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF IDAHO**

In the Matter of the Protest of	)	
	)	DOCKET NO. 23272
[Redacted],	)	
	)	
Petitioner.	)	DECISION
_____	)	

This case arises from a timely protest of a State Tax Commission (Commission) staff decision denying a property tax reduction benefit for taxable year 2010. This matter was submitted for a decision based on the documents in the file. The Commission has reviewed the file and makes its decision.

The amount of the property tax reduction benefit depends on the income received by a claimant and, if married, the claimant's spouse--the greater the income, the smaller the benefit. [Redacted] (petitioner) filed a property tax reduction benefit application on April 13, 2010.

The staff routinely reviews the applications petitioners submit to the county where they live. During this process, the staff examined the petitioner's application and the attached documents. The petitioner's application shows he is married. The petitioner's wife's income was not listed in the application. The staff notified the petitioner of the intent to deny him the benefit for taxable year 2010 because the income information shown in the application did not appear to be complete.

A response to the intent to deny letter was received on behalf of the petitioner, and his file was transferred to the Legal/Tax Policy Division for administrative review.

Idaho Code § 63-701 states in pertinent part:

DEFINITIONS. As used in this chapter:  
(1) **"Claimant" means a person who has filed a claim** under the provisions of sections 63-701 through 63-710, Idaho Code. Except as provided in section 63-

702(2), Idaho Code, on January 1 of the year or before April 15 in which the claim was filed a claimant must be an owner of a homestead and be:

- (a) Not less than sixty-five (65) years old; or
- (b) A child under the age of eighteen (18) years who is fatherless or motherless or who has been abandoned by any surviving parent or parents; or
- (c) A widow or widower; or
- (d) A disabled person who is recognized as disabled by the social security administration pursuant to title 42 of the United States Code, or by the railroad retirement board pursuant to title 45 of the United States Code, or by the office of management and budget pursuant to title 5 of the United States Code; or
- (e) A disabled veteran of any war engaged in by the United States, whose disability is recognized as a service-connected disability of a degree of ten percent (10%) or more, or who has a pension for nonservice-connected disabilities, in accordance with laws and regulations administered by the United States veterans administration; or
- (f) A person, as specified in 42 U.S.C. 1701, who was or is entitled to receive benefits because he is known to have been taken by a hostile force as a prisoner, hostage or otherwise; or
- (g) Blind.

(2) "Homestead" means the dwelling, owner-occupied by the claimant as described in this chapter and used as the primary dwelling place of the claimant and may be occupied by any members of the household as their home, and so much of the land surrounding it, not exceeding one (1) acre, as is reasonably necessary for the use of the dwelling as a home. It may consist of a part of a multidwelling or multipurpose building and part of the land upon which it is built. "Homestead" does not include personal property such as furniture, furnishings or appliances, but a manufactured home may be a homestead.

(3) **"Household" means the claimant and the claimant's spouse.** The term does not include bona fide lessees, tenants, or roomers and boarders on contract. "Household" includes persons described in subsection (8) (b) of this section.

(4) **"Household income" means all income received by the claimant and, if married, all income received by the claimant's spouse, in a calendar year.** [Emphasis added.]

Income for the purpose of the property tax reduction benefit is defined in Idaho Code § 63-701(5):

- (5) "Income" means the sum of federal adjusted gross income as defined in the Internal Revenue Code, as defined in section 63-3004, Idaho Code, and to the extent not already included in federal adjusted gross income:
  - (a) Alimony;
  - (b) Support money;
  - (c) Nontaxable strike benefits;
  - (d) The nontaxable amount of any individual retirement account, pension or annuity, (including railroad retirement benefits, all payments received under the federal social security act except the social security death benefit as specified in this subsection, state unemployment insurance laws, and veterans disability

pensions and compensation, excluding any return of principal paid by the recipient of an annuity and excluding rollovers as provided in section 402 or 403 of the Internal Revenue Code);

(e) Nontaxable interest received from the federal government or any of its instrumentalities or a state government or any of its instrumentalities;

(f) Worker's compensation; and

(g) The gross amount of loss of earnings insurance.

It does not include gifts from nongovernmental sources or inheritances. To the extent not reimbursed, the cost of medical care as defined in section 213(d) of the Internal Revenue Code, incurred or paid by the claimant and, if married, the claimant's spouse, may be deducted from income. To the extent not reimbursed, personal funeral expenses, including prepaid funeral expenses and premiums on funeral insurance, of the claimant and claimant's spouse only, may be deducted from income up to an annual maximum of five thousand dollars (\$5,000) per claim. "Income" does not include veterans disability pensions received by a person described in subsection (1)(e) who is a claimant or a claimant's spouse if the disability pension is received pursuant to a service-connected disability of a degree of forty percent (40%) or more. "Income" does not include dependency and indemnity compensation or death benefits paid to a person described in subsection (1) of this section by the United States department of veterans affairs and arising from a service-connected death or disability. "Income" does not include lump sum death benefits made by the social security administration pursuant to 42 U.S.C. section 402(i). Documentation of medical expenses may be required by the county assessor, board of equalization and state tax commission in such form as the county assessor, board of equalization or state tax commission shall determine. **"Income" shall be that received in the calendar year immediately preceding the year in which a claim is filed.** Where a claimant and/or the claimant's spouse does not file a federal tax return, the claimant's and/or the claimant's spouse's federal adjusted gross income, for purposes of this section, shall be an income equivalent to federal adjusted gross income had the claimant and/or the claimant's spouse filed a federal tax return, as determined by the county assessor. The county assessor, board of equalization or state tax commission may require documentation of income in such form as each shall determine, including, but not limited to: copies of federal or state tax returns and any attachments thereto; and income reporting forms such as the W2 and 1099. [Emphasis added.]

Idaho Code § 63-701 uses definitions to describe eligibility and income requirements for an applicant to qualify for a property tax reduction benefit. These definitions are not the same definitions used in other sections of the Idaho Code or even in the common dictionary. However, the definitions are very specific.

The law must be followed as written. If the law is socially or economically unsound, the power to correct it is legislative, not within the powers of the Tax Commission. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co. v. Neill, 79 Idaho 385, 319 P.2d 195 (1957).

In the present case, the petitioner filed the claim. He is the claimant. The household is defined as the claimant and the claimant's spouse. Household income is defined as the income received by the claimant and, if the claimant is married, the claimant's spouse. All income received by both spouses must be included on the application to determine eligibility for the benefit.

The petitioner reported his 2009 income in the application for the 2010 property tax reduction benefit, however, he did not list any income for his spouse. Without the petitioner's spouse's information, the petitioner's application is incomplete. The petitioner must be denied the 2010 property tax reduction benefit.

WHEREFORE, the decision of the State Tax Commission staff to deny the property tax reduction benefit is hereby APPROVED, AFFIRMED, and MADE FINAL.

An explanation of the petitioner's right to appeal this decision is enclosed.

DATED this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 2010.

IDAHO STATE TAX COMMISSION

---

COMMISSIONER

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 2010, a copy of the within and foregoing DECISION was served by sending the same by United States mail, postage prepaid, in an envelope addressed to:

[Redacted]

Receipt No.

---