

BEFORE THE TAX COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF IDAHO

In the Matter of the Protest of)	
)	DOCKET NO. 21849
[REDACTED],)	
)	DECISION
Petitioner.)	
_____)	

This case arises from a timely protest of a State Tax Commission (Commission) staff's decision adjusting the property tax reduction benefit for 2008. An informal conference was requested by the petitioner and was held via telephone on May 12, 2009. This matter was submitted for a decision based on the documents in the file. The Commission has reviewed the file and makes its decision based on its contents.

All property within the jurisdiction of this state is subject to property tax. A property tax reduction benefit is available to certain qualifying individuals. The benefit is in the form of payment of all or a portion of the applicant's property tax on the dwelling he/she owns and occupies. The payment is funded by state sales tax.

[Redacted] (petitioner) submitted an application for a property tax reduction benefit on January 15, 2008. The staff of the [Redacted] sent that application, together with other applications, to the Commission for review and processing. The application was approved, and the petitioner received a benefit for the payment of property tax on her homestead.

Idaho Code §§ 63-707 and 63-708 provide for an audit of all claims and recovery of benefits that have been paid in error. During the review process, the staff contacted the Veteran's Administration (VA) to verify the petitioner's disability rating. The information provided by the VA states that in 2007, the petitioner received Veteran's benefits in the amount of \$11,281 for a non service connected disability.

A Notice of Deficiency Determination (NODD) was sent to the petitioner to advise her of the determination that the Veteran's benefit she received must be included in the income reported on the application she filed with [Redacted]

The petitioner protested the NODD and her file was transferred to the Legal/Tax Policy division for administrative review.

Idaho Code § 63-701 states, in pertinent part:

Definitions. As used in this chapter:

(1) "Claimant" means a person who has filed an application under section 63-602G, Idaho Code, and has filed a claim under the provisions of sections 63-701 through 63-710, Idaho Code. Except as provided in section 63-702(2), Idaho Code, on January 1, or before April 15, of the year in which the claimant on the homestead in question, a claimant must be an owner of the homestead and on January 1 of said year a claimant must be:

(a) Not less than sixty-five (65) years old; or

(b) A child under the age of eighteen (18) years who is fatherless or motherless or who has been abandoned by any surviving parent or parents; or

(c) A widow or widower; or

(d) A disabled person who is recognized as disabled by the social security administration pursuant to title 42 of the United States Code, or by the railroad retirement board pursuant to title 45 of the United States Code, or by the office of management and budget pursuant to title 5 of the United States Code; or

(e) **A disabled veteran of any war engaged in by the United States, whose disability is recognized as a service-connected disability of a degree of ten percent (10%) or more, or who has a pension for nonservice-connected disabilities, in accordance with laws and regulations administered by the United States department of veterans affairs; or**

(f) A person, as specified in 42 U.S.C. 1701, who was or is entitled to receive benefits because he is known to have been taken by a hostile force as a prisoner, hostage or otherwise; or

(g) Blind.

(2) "Homestead" means the dwelling, owner-occupied by the claimant as described in this chapter and used as the primary dwelling place of the claimant and may be occupied by any members of the household as their home, and so much of the land surrounding it, not exceeding one (1) acre, as is reasonably necessary for the use of the dwelling as a home. It may consist of a

part of a multidwelling or multipurpose building and part of the land upon which it is built. "Homestead" does not include personal property such as furniture, furnishings or appliances, but a manufactured home may be a homestead.

(3) "Household" means the claimant and the claimant's spouse. The term does not include bona fide lessees, tenants, or roomers and boarders on contract. "Household" includes persons described in subsection (8)(b) of this section.

(4) "Household income" means all income received by the claimant and, if married, all income received by the claimant's spouse, in a calendar year. (Emphasis added.)

The amount of property tax reduction depends on income--the greater the income, the smaller the benefit. However, income is defined differently for the property tax reduction benefit program than it is described in the income tax code. Income for property tax reduction benefit purposes is defined in Idaho Code § 63-701(5):

(5) "Income" means the sum of federal adjusted gross income as defined in the Internal Revenue Code, as defined in section 63-3004, Idaho Code, and to the extent not already included in federal adjusted gross income:

(a) Alimony;

(b) Support money;

(c) Nontaxable strike benefits;

(d) The nontaxable amount of any individual retirement account, pension or annuity, (including railroad retirement benefits, all payments received under the federal social security act except the social security death benefit as specified in this subsection, state unemployment insurance laws, and veterans disability pensions and compensation, excluding any return of principal paid by the recipient of an annuity and excluding rollovers as provided in section 402 or 403 of the Internal Revenue Code);

(e) Nontaxable interest received from the federal government or any of its instrumentalities or a state government or any of its instrumentalities;

(f) Worker's compensation; and

(g) The gross amount of loss of earnings insurance.

It does not include gifts from nongovernmental sources or inheritances. To the extent not reimbursed, the cost of medical care as defined in section 213(d) of the Internal Revenue Code, incurred or paid by the claimant and, if married, the claimant's spouse, may be deducted from income. To the extent not reimbursed, personal funeral expenses, including prepaid funeral expenses and premiums on funeral insurance, of the claimant and claimant's

spouse only, may be deducted from income up to an annual maximum of five thousand dollars (\$5,000) per claim. **"Income" does not include veterans disability pensions received by a person described in subsection (1)(e) who is a claimant or a claimant's spouse if the disability pension is received pursuant to a service-connected disability of a degree of forty percent (40%) or more.** "Income" does not include dependency and indemnity compensation or death benefits paid to a person described in subsection (1) of this section by the United States department of veterans affairs and arising from a service-connected death or disability. "Income" does not include lump sum death benefits made by the social security administration pursuant to 42 U.S.C. section 402(i). Documentation of medical expenses may be required by the county assessor, board of equalization and state tax commission in such form as the county assessor, board of equalization or state tax commission shall determine. "Income" shall be that received in the calendar year immediately preceding the year in which a claim is filed. Where a claimant and/or the claimant's spouse does not file a federal tax return, the claimant's and/or the claimant's spouse's federal adjusted gross income, for purposes of this section, shall be an income equivalent to federal adjusted gross income had the claimant and/or the claimant's spouse filed a federal tax return, as determined by the county assessor. The county assessor, board of equalization or state tax commission may require documentation of income in such form as each shall determine, including, but not limited to: copies of federal or state tax returns and any attachments thereto; and income reporting forms such as the W2 and 1099. (Emphasis added.)

Idaho Code § 63-701 uses definitions to describe eligibility and income requirements for an applicant to qualify for the property tax reduction benefit. These definitions are not the same definitions used in other sections of the Idaho Code or even in the common dictionary. However, the definitions are very specific. The law must be followed as written. If the law is socially or economically unsound, the power to correct it is legislative, not within the powers of the Tax Commission. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co. v. Neill, 79 Idaho 385, 319 P.2d 195 (1957).

In the present case, the petitioner received a property tax reduction benefit of \$881.52. However, this benefit amount was calculated on a net income amount that did not include the \$11,281 the petitioner received from the VA. The benefits received from the VA were for a non service connected disability and, therefore, must be included in income. When the petitioner's VA benefit income of \$11,281 is added to the social security income of \$11,676, and unreimbursed medical expenses of \$1,721 are subtracted, the petitioner's total income for the purpose of the property tax reduction is \$21,236. The petitioner is entitled to receive a benefit not to exceed \$620. The petitioner received a payment in excess of what she is entitled to, therefore, re-payment of the monies is appropriate.

WHEREFORE, the Notice of Deficiency Determination letter dated April 6, 2009, is hereby APPROVED, AFFIRMED, and MADE FINAL.

IT IS ORDERED and THIS DOES ORDER that the petitioner pays the following 2008 property tax benefit reimbursement and interest.

BENEFIT	INTEREST	TOTAL
\$261.52	\$3.99	\$265.51

DEMAND for immediate payment of the foregoing amount is hereby made and given.

An explanation of the petitioner's right to appeal this decision is enclosed.

DATED this _____ day of _____, 2009.

IDAHO STATE TAX COMMISSION

COMMISSIONER

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this _____ day of _____, 2009, a copy of the within and foregoing DECISION was served by sending the same by United States mail, postage prepaid, in an envelope addressed to:

[Redacted]

Receipt No.
