

BEFORE THE TAX COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF IDAHO

In the Matter of the Protest of)	
)	DOCKET NO. 19696
[Redacted],)	
)	DECISION
Petitioners.)	
_____)	

This case arises from a timely protest of a State Tax Commission staff decision to deny the property tax reduction benefit for 2006. This matter was submitted for a decision based on the documents in the file. The State Tax Commission has reviewed the file and makes its decision.

[Redacted] (petitioners) filed an application for a property tax reduction benefit on March 8, 2006. During review of that application and the supporting documents, the information was compared with federal and state records. The staff identified income disbursed from individual retirement accounts (IRA) that had not been included in the income listed in the application.

The staff sent the petitioners a letter advising them their income total for the purpose of the property tax reduction benefit was going to be increased to include the nontaxable portion of the funds. In addition, the petitioners were asked to provide documentation to support the \$5,066.88 of medical expenses they had listed. The petitioners protested the intended action that would deny them the benefit. They sent proof of their out-of-pocket medical expenses and explained their position regarding the IRA funds. Their file was transferred to the Legal/Tax Policy Division for administrative review.

All property within the jurisdiction of this state is subject to property tax. A property tax reduction benefit program is available to certain qualifying individuals throughout the state. The benefit is in the form of payment of all or a portion of the applicant's property tax on the dwelling

he/she owns and occupies. The payment is funded by state sales tax.

The amount of property tax reduction depends on income--the greater the income, the smaller the benefit. However, income is defined differently for the property tax reduction benefit program than it is described in the income tax code. Income for property tax reduction benefit purposes is defined in Idaho Code § 63-701(5):

(5) **"Income" means the sum of federal adjusted gross income** as defined in the Internal Revenue Code, as defined in section 63-3004, Idaho Code, and to the extent not already included in federal adjusted gross income:

(a) Alimony;

(b) Support money;

(c) Nontaxable strike benefits;

(d) **The nontaxable amount of any individual retirement account, pension or annuity**, (including railroad retirement benefits, all payments received under the federal social security act except the social security death benefit as specified in this subsection, state unemployment insurance laws, and veterans disability pensions and compensation, **excluding any return of principal paid by the recipient of an annuity and excluding rollovers as provided in section 402 or 403 of the Internal Revenue Code**);

(e) Nontaxable interest received from the federal government or any of its instrumentalities or a state government or any of its instrumentalities;

(f) Worker's compensation; and

(g) The gross amount of loss of earnings insurance.

It does not include gifts from nongovernmental sources or inheritances. To the extent not reimbursed, the cost of medical care as defined in section 213(d) of the Internal Revenue Code, incurred or paid by the claimant and, if married, the claimant's spouse, may be deducted from income. To the extent not reimbursed, personal funeral expenses, including prepaid funeral expenses and premiums on funeral insurance, of the claimant and claimant's spouse only, may be deducted from income up to an annual maximum of five thousand dollars (\$5,000) per claim. "Income" does not include veterans disability pensions received by a person described in subsection (1)(e) who is a claimant or a claimant's spouse if the disability pension is received pursuant to a service-connected disability of a degree of forty percent (40%) or more. "Income" does not include dependency and indemnity compensation or death benefits paid to a

person described in subsection (1) of this section by the United States department of veterans affairs and arising from a service-connected death or disability. "Income" does not include lump sum death benefits made by the social security administration pursuant to 42 U.S.C. section 402(i). Documentation of medical expenses may be required by the county assessor, board of equalization and state tax commission in such form as the county assessor, board of equalization or state tax commission shall determine. "Income" shall be that received in the calendar year immediately preceding the year in which a claim is filed. Where a claimant and/or the claimant's spouse does not file a federal tax return, the claimant's and/or the claimant's spouse's federal adjusted gross income, for purposes of this section, shall be an income equivalent to federal adjusted gross income had the claimant and/or the claimant's spouse filed a federal tax return, as determined by the county assessor. The county assessor, board of equalization or state tax commission may require documentation of income in such form as each shall determine, including, but not limited to: copies of federal or state tax returns and any attachments thereto; and income reporting forms such as the W2 and 1099. (Emphasis added.)

The calculation of income starts with federal adjusted gross income and, thereafter, makes certain additions and deductions. The nontaxable portion of IRA funds is specifically required to be included in income to determine the benefit amount a qualified applicant is to receive. One exception is funds that are qualified as “rollovers as provided in section 402 or 403 of the Internal Revenue Code.”

In their letter of protest, the petitioners said they had been required to claim the same funds in their last year’s application when they withdrew the money out of a traditional IRA and put it into a Roth IRA. They explained that, this year, they withdrew the money from the Roth IRA. They objected to having the funds included in their income again.

Idaho Code § 63-701(5) looks at an applicant’s qualifications and income each year independent of other years. The definition of income requires the funds disbursed from an IRA during the year prior to the year for which the property tax reduction benefit is being requested to be

included in income.

During 2004, the petitioners withdrew funds from their traditional IRA and deposited those funds in a Roth IRA. The transaction was not a qualified rollover. They were required to include those funds in their application for the 2005 property tax reduction benefit.

During 2005, the petitioners withdrew the same funds out of the Roth IRA. They did not redeposit those funds. The transaction was not a qualified rollover. The total funds received from the Roth IRA must be included in the petitioners' 2006 application for the property tax reduction benefit.

In the application the petitioners submitted for the 2006 benefit, they listed their gross social security income. However, when they listed their total medical expenses, they failed to include the portion of their social security that was Medicare premiums. The petitioners qualify for a deduction for \$6,944 of medical expenses rather than the \$5,066.88 shown in the application.

When the \$3,435.87 IRA distribution is added and the \$1,877 additional medical expense is subtracted, the petitioners' 2005 net income for determining the amount of their property tax reduction benefit is \$22,838. The petitioners qualify for a property tax reduction benefit of an amount not to exceed **\$490** rather than the \$620 shown in the application as submitted.

The State Tax Commission is aware there is some potential this decision could cause a hardship to the property tax reduction benefit applicant. The proper jurisdiction to handle such hardship situations falls with the county commissioners pursuant to Idaho Code § 63-711.

WHEREFORE, the decision of the State Tax Commission staff to change the property tax reduction benefit is APPROVED, AFFIRMED and MADE FINAL.

An explanation of the taxpayers' right to appeal this decision is included with this decision.

DATED this _____ day of _____, 2006.

IDAHO STATE TAX COMMISSION

COMMISSIONER

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this _____ day of _____, 2006, a copy of the within and foregoing DECISION was served by sending the same by United States mail, postage prepaid, in an envelope addressed to:

[Redacted]

Receipt No.
